

REVIEW
of the official reviewer for dissertation work
Nurfer Tercan on the theme «Al-Farabi's philosophy of music»
presented for the degree of Doctor of Philosophy (PhD) in the specialty «8D02202-Philosophy».

№	Criteria	Eligibility (one of the options must be checked) Соответствие требованиям (необходимо отметить один из вариантов)	Justification of the position of the official reviewer
1.	The topic of the thesis (as of the date of its approval) corresponds to the directions of development of science and/or state programs	1.1 Compliance with priority areas of science development or government programs:	The dissertation research and its results refer with priority areas of science development as “Research in the field of education and science” and “Research in the field of social sciences and humanities”. The work can be viewed in the context of the state program "Rukhani Zhangyru" and the 1150th anniversary of the scientist and philosopher, which is celebrated under the auspices of UNESCO. Also it refers to “Seven facets of the Great Steppe: the heritage and origins of the spiritual modernization of society” with such specific sections as “Great names of the Great Steppe” and “A thousand years of steppe folklore and music”.
		1) The thesis was completed within the framework of a project or target program financed from the state budget (indicate the name and number of the project or program) 2) The thesis was completed within the framework of another state program (indicate the name of the program) 3) The dissertation corresponds to the priority direction of the development of science, approved by the Higher Scientific and Technical Commission under the Government of the Republic of Kazakhstan (indicate the direction)	The dissertation corresponds to the priority direction of the development of science, approved by the Higher Scientific and Technical Commission under the Government of the Republic of Kazakhstan “Research in the field of education and science” and “Research in the field of social sciences and humanities”. No references to the belonging of the project and state

			program.
2.	Importance for science	The work makes/does not make a significant contribution to science, and its importance is well disclosed/not disclosed.	The work makes a significant contribution to science, and its importance is well disclosed. Research shows the importance of music that fulfils scientific purposes in philosophical disciplines in systematic and historical approach. The dissertation work is sufficiently disclosed and makes a significant contribution to science, in particular, in scientific approach of understanding of the role of music from different way and in al-Farabi's work.
3.	The principle of independence	Self-reliance level: 1) <u>High</u> ; 2) Medium; 3) Low; 4) No independence	Self-reliance level is high and we can see it from the results of the thesis and published articles in different academic journals.
4.	The principle of inner unity	4.1 Justification of the relevance of the thesis: 1) <u>Justified</u> ; 2) Partially justified; 3) Not justified.	The dissertation is justified by the relevance since the scientific heritage of al-Farabi in the context of his philosophy of music is in high demand and not sufficient studied.
		4.2 The content of the thesis reflects the topic of the thesis: 1) <u>Reflects</u> ; 2) Partially reflects; 3) Does not reflect	The content of the thesis reflects the topic of the thesis. The topic of the study, its goals and objectives, the main assumptions submitted for defense, the results and conclusions are consistent with each other and correspond to the topic of the dissertation.
		4.3. The purpose and objectives correspond to the topic of the thesis: 1) <u>correspond</u> ;	The purpose and objectives correspond to the topic of the thesis.

		<p>2) partially correspond; 3) do not correspond</p>	
		<p>4.4 All sections and provisions of the thesis are logically interconnected: 1) <u>completely interconnected</u>; 2) the interconnection is partial; 3) there is no interconnection</p>	Dissertation research is completely interconnected because it is structured, complete, holistic and interrelated work.
		<p>4.5 The new solutions (principles, methods) proposed by the author are reasoned and evaluated in comparison with the known solutions: 1) <u>there is a critical analysis</u>; 2) partial analysis; 3) the analysis does not represent one's own opinions, but quotes from other authors.</p>	There is a critical analysis based on the work of many scientists and thinkers according to the topic of the thesis.
5.	Scientific novelty principle	<p>5.1 Are the scientific results and provisions new? 1) completely new; 2) <u>partially new (25-75% are new)</u>; 3) not new (less than 25% are new)</p>	The scientific results and provisions are partially new.
		<p>5.2 Are the dissertation findings new? 1) completely new; 2) <u>partially new (25-75% are new)</u>; 3) not new (less than 25% are new)</p>	The dissertation findings are partially new.
		<p>5.3 Technical, technological, economic or management decisions are new and reasonable: 1) completely new; 2) <u>partially new (25-75% are new)</u>; 3) not new (less than 25% are new)</p>	Technical, technological, economic or management decisions are partially new and reasonable.
6.	The validity of the main findings	All main conclusions are/are not based on scientifically significant evidence or well-grounded (for qualitative research and areas of training in the arts and humanities)	All main conclusions are well-grounded for qualitative research and areas of training in the arts and humanities.
7.	The main	It is necessary to answer the following questions for each provision separately:	Provisions №1. These are only possible

	provisions for the defense	<p>7.1 Is the provition proven?</p> <p>1) proven; 2) rather proven; 3) rather not proven; 4) not proven</p> <p>7.2 Is it trivial?</p> <p>1) yes; 2) no</p> <p>7.3 Is it new?</p> <p>1) yes; 2) no</p> <p>7.4 Application level:</p> <p>1) narrow; 2) medium; 3) wide</p> <p>7.5 Is it proven in the article?</p> <p>1) yes; 2) no</p>	<p>with such pure theoretical intuition. This faculty is the source of intuitive and irrational intelligence. Intuition is an evolutionary extension of the inner sense. The application of cognitive categories, or understanding, is used to create a whole through the unity of some elements intuitively.</p> <p>7.1 Is the provition proven?</p> <p>1) proven; 7.2 Is it trivial?</p> <p>1) no; 7.3 Is it new?</p> <p>1) yes; 7.4 Application level:</p> <p>3) wide; 7.5 Is it proven in the article?</p> <p>1) yes.</p> <p>Provisions №2. From a philosophical point of view, the problem of intersubjectivity and discussions are precious in terms of understanding the consciousness of the other. The language-thought-world axis has left its place to the aesthetic object-thought-world in the problem of aesthetic intersubjectivity.</p> <p>7.1 Is the provition proven?</p> <p>1) proven; 7.2 Is it trivial?</p> <p>1) no; 7.3 Is it new?</p> <p>1) yes; 7.4 Application level:</p> <p>3) wide;</p>
--	----------------------------	-----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------	-------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------

			<p>7.5 Is it proven in the article? 1) yes.</p> <p>Provisions №3. Fârâbî negotiated about tunes and rhythms that are suitable for human nature in his works on music, as if reversing the claims of some ethnomusicologists who saw early Islamic Music as consisting only of theory; He focused on the applicability of these not only in theory but also in practice.</p> <p>7.1 Is the provition proven? 1) proven;</p> <p>7.2 Is it trivial? 1) no;</p> <p>7.3 Is it new? 1) yes;</p> <p>7.4 Application level: 3) wide;</p> <p>7.5 Is it proven in the article? 1) yes.</p> <p>Provisions №4. The Kitab al Musiqa has given us an idea about the causality and necessity of working on the philosophy of music, along with the scientific method leading to the knowledge of the unknown first and subsequent foundations. The philosophy of music helps to interpret and make sense of thoughts. From a phenomenological perspective, as Al-Fârâbî also writes, the body and the senses determine a person's philosophy and thought.</p> <p>7.1 Is the provition proven?</p>
--	--	--	------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------

			<p>1) proven; 7.2 Is it trivial? 1) no; 7.3 Is it new? 1) yes; 7.4 Application level: 3) wide; 7.5 Is it proven in the article? 1) yes.</p> <p>Provisions №5. Farabi argues that sensation is an abstraction realized through sense organs within this framework. At the last stage of abstraction, form is perceived in its universal reality, utterly independent of its material relations, according to Farabi. So, while it corresponds to an abstraction process that essentially takes place in the mind, passing through the stages of knowing, sensation and imagination, it expresses an ascent from the particular to the universal or from the material form to the fully intelligible form.</p> <p>7.1 Is the provition proven? 1) proven; 7.2 Is it trivial? 1) no; 7.3 Is it new? 1) yes; 7.4 Application level: 3) wide; 7.5 Is it proven in the article? 1) yes.</p>
--	--	--	----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------

8.	The principle of reliability Reliability of sources and information provided	8.1 Choice of methodology - is justified or the methodology is described in sufficient detail 1) yes; 2) no	The choice of methodology is justified.
		8.2 The results of the thesis were obtained using modern methods of scientific research and methods of processing and interpreting data using computer technologies: 1) yes; 2) no	The results of the dissertation work are reliable and interpreted at a high level. In addition, the main results of the work were published in scientific articles which prove their reliability.
		8.3 Theoretical conclusions, models, identified relationships and patterns have been proven and confirmed by experimental research (for areas of training in pedagogical sciences, the results have been proven on the basis of a pedagogical experiment): 1) yes; 2) no	Theoretical conclusions, models, identified relationships and patterns have been proven.
		8.4 Important statements are confirmed / partially confirmed / not confirmed by references to current and reliable scientific literature	Important statements are confirmed. The author links to works and publications in international journals and up-to-date scientific literature on the main statements.
		8.5 Used literature sources are sufficient/not sufficient for a literature review	Used literature sources are sufficient. The list of used literature is wide and quite enough for a literature review on this research topic.
9	Practical value principle	9.1 The thesis has theoretical value: 1) yes; 2) no	The dissertation has a high theoretical value. Since the influence of music on scientific and educational aspects is so great that this work will be an important contribution to the philosophy of music.
		9.2 The thesis is of practical importance and there is a high probability of	The dissertation is of practical importance and there is a high

		applying the results obtained in practice: 1) yes; 2) no	probability of applying the results obtained in practice.
		9.3 Are the practice suggestions new? 1) completely new; 2) partially new (25-75% are new); 3) not new (less than 25% are new)	Practice suggestions are partially new.
10.	The quality of writing and design	Academic writing quality: 1) high; 2) average; 3) below average; 4) low.	The dissertation work is done at a high level, it is a completed research work.


Nurfer Tercan's dissertation work is a serious contribution to the development of philosophy of music. It is qualified scientific work and meets all requirements. So my recommendation:

1) to award the degree of Doctor of Philosophy (PhD) by specialty "8D02202-Philosophy" Nurfer Tercan.

Official Reviewer:

PhD, assistant professor of International Information University

(place of work, academic title)


(signature)

Tanabayeva Anar
(FULL NAME)

